

**UNAPPROVED MINUTES  
SUBJECT TO CONFIRMATION**

**MARICOPA COUNTY COMMUNITY COLLEGE DISTRICT**

**GOVERNING BOARD**

**APRIL 10, 2001**

**MINUTES**

An executive session and a strategic conversation of the Maricopa County Community College District Governing Board was scheduled to be held at 5:30 p.m. at Gateway Community College, 108 North 40<sup>th</sup> Street, Phoenix, Arizona, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice having been duly given.

**PRESENT**

**GOVERNING BOARD**

Donald R. Campbell, President  
Nancy Stein, Secretary  
Ed Contreras, Member  
Linda B. Rosenthal, Member  
Gene Eastin, Member

**ADMINISTRATION**

Fred Gaskin  
Phil Randolph  
Anna Solley  
Rufus Glasper  
Ron Bleed  
Raul Cardenas  
Larry Christiansen  
John Cordova  
Stan Grossman  
Homero Lopez  
Linda Thor  
Tessa Martinez Pollack  
Art DeCabooter  
Morris Johnson  
Arnette Ward  
Paul Dale for Gina Kranitz  
Fred Gaudet

**ABSENT**

**STATE BOARD**

Nick Balich

**CALL TO  
ORDER**

The executive session was called to order at 5:30 p.m. by President Don Campbell and concluded at 6:00 p.m. The meeting reconvened at 6:30 p.m.

President Campbell announced the presence of the following classes: Dr. Farmakis EDU 250 class; Dr. Ginny Stahl's EDU 250 class; and, Dr. Art DeCabooter's HED 533 class.

## STRATEGIC CONVERSATION

### REVIEW OF REPORT OF THE MARICOPA COMMUNITY COLLEGE DISTRICT GOVERNING BOARD'S GOAL ON DEVELOPMENTAL EDUCATION

Dr. Anna Solley introduced the conversation on developmental education and provided statistics that stressed the reason why Maricopa realizes, values, and supports the vital importance of providing academic opportunity to those whose educational foundation is limited. Co-presenters were: Dr. Mike Rooney, Dr. Ginny Stahl, and Dr. Art DeCabooter. Dr. Solley explained the conversation would consist of a student panel, a faculty panel, and a breakout session.

Dr. John Cordova, President of South Mountain Community College, moderated the student panel. The student panel was made up of the following individuals: Donavon Barney (SCC), Lidia Favela (PC), Joel Dickinson (GCC), and Gedamnesh Mekonen (GWC). The students were asked to respond to the following questions:

- Where did you begin and where are you now?
- Who helped you?
- How can we improve at the community colleges?

1. **Donavon Barney** responded that he is in his third year at Scottsdale Community College and his experiences have been very fulfilling. Being Native American (Navajo) and coming to SCC was a culture shock. He felt isolated and unprepared for what he experienced. He attended Window Rock High School, a AAA school, however, not as advanced as schools here in Metropolitan Phoenix. He is now taking Math 151 and feels very proud of the progress he has made. His classes have been fun and the math center has been easy to use. Both CD Rom programs and tutors are a big help. He has experienced assistance from many different sources. Counselors have also been very helpful.

In answer to the third question, Donavon stated that math centers could offer take home tests in the form scantron sheets to facilitate immediate scoring. He also indicated that "emphasis notes" are very helpful. These facilitate the comparison of personal notes with notes provided by the instructor. With reference to recruiting, it would be helpful if the lower level classes were stressed in order to overcome the intimidation students feel about attending college. Lastly, more CD Rom curriculum and on-line practice pages could be made available to students.

2. **Lidia Favela** stated she has benefited very much from all her teachers and gives credit to one of her instructors who has helped her tremendously. She indicated she has to do her homework 2-3 times in order to understand the material. She relocated to Arizona from Mexico where she previously worked as an administrator in the Sociology/Psychology field. Initially she was unable to communicate with anyone and had to memorize words she had never used before. She is now able to communicate her ideas and studies hard to excel in her classes. She suggested that teachers should teach ESL and then perhaps they would understand the struggles foreign students experience.

Lidia answered the third question by stating that she felt teachers tried their best and perhaps ESL students would be more successful if real life computer classes were offered. She would like to take part in more group activities with other ESL students. Lastly, she stated that watching television was of tremendous help to her in learning English.

3. **Joel Dickinson** is a returning adult student who has come up through the Math Department. He worked in construction for fifteen years prior to deciding to pursue further education. He goes to school full-time and works in the tutoring center. He started out in Beginning Algebra and is now taking trigonometry. He hopes to transfer to Arizona State University to pursue an engineering degree. He indicated he felt the placement test was very important. He also stated that at one time he felt the world worked against you but has experienced that the assistance available has been critical to his success.

Joel responded to the third question by stating he would like to see better advisement on transferring to the university. He likes the computer lab and feels that there are many things in place to help people succeed, however, students don't always understand that people are there to help them.

4. **Gedamnesh Mekonen** is of Ethiopian descent. She came to the United States from Germany. Both she and her husband were both doctors in Ethiopia. She initially understood very little English and after taking a placement test started out in Eng 012. She is now taking English 101 and her teacher spends time with her on a one on one basis. She stated that college is important and helps students fulfill their dreams, however it is difficult when students have to work, take care of families and attend school. She stated that financial assistance would help them succeed because the desire is there.

Gedamnesh indicated that practicing grammar on the computer was very helpful. She felt it was very important for instructors to find out why students do not attend classes and to spend more time assisting students.

Dr. Ginny Stahl, Dean of Student Services at Scottsdale Community College, introduced the faculty panel consisting of:

Sally Rings, Reading Instructional Council from PVC  
April Strom, Math Instructional Council from CCC  
Gail Shay, ESL Instructional Council from GWC  
Bonnie Ehmman, English Instructional Council from GWC  
Lois Bartholomew, Student Services Center at CGC

1. **Sally Rings** commented that the remedial concept is a deficit model, whereas the developmental model focuses on students' potentials and abilities. The developmental model is far more reaching (interpersonal skills, attitudes, and motivations). There is shared responsibility and student success. She felt that integrating courses with services and supporting students is what works.

2. **April Strom** felt the use of non-traditional teaching methods such as collaboratively learning, multiple intelligences, computer software were extremely helpful. Tutoring is also a great assistance. She suggested that communications between counselors, advisors and faculty should be improved to better assist students. Waivers should be decreased and additional full-time faculty would make them more available to students.
  
3. **Gail Shay** stated that ESL is a growing field and was appreciative of the opportunity to address this need. Learning a language is a way of survival for many students. Conversational competence can be acquired in an average of three years and workplace competence takes up to seven years. This is a long process. She stated that according to a survey taken of 300 ESL students (intermediate or advanced), most were educated, most were working full-time, most were female, wanted to use computers, can use computers, and own computers. There is a strong need to develop computer classes for ESL students.
  
4. **Bonnie Ehmman** stated that she has become somewhat of a pragmatist. Last year in teaching 45 ESL students she discovered she can't use the same methods to reach students and sees a need to incorporate computers. Her classes are made up of doctors, dentists, engineers, and are quite diverse. She recognizes that teaching methods have to change. Students need more one-on-one time with teachers and the ability to use computer labs. There is also a need to look at practical things such as space for the growing numbers of students in a class. Teachers need training in alternative teaching methods. Developmental students do not just go into the workforce but many go on to the universities.
  
5. **Lois Bartholomew** stated that we need educated citizens. Students have dreams and want to learn but they need time to learn and be together and absorb learning. Learning is not a fast food industry – we are education and need orientation. We need to welcome students.

Dr. Mike Rooney, Director of Student Services at the District Office, explained that the next portion of the strategic conversation would take them to breakout sessions according to the color of dots on their nametags. In the breakout sessions they were to discuss the following questions:

- What are the challenges we will face in meeting the needs of developmental education students in the next 3 to 5 years?
- How should we address these challenges?

#### Report-Outs:

##### Green Dot Group – April Strom, facilitator

1. There is a need to make college more accessible.
2. Point out success stories to promote development education program.
3. Community colleges should not be fast food places but should require students to take all the steps necessary.
4. There should be cooperative advising.

##### Blue Dot Group – Gail Shay, facilitator

1. There should be collaboration with the high schools.

**Strategic Conversation  
April 10, 2001**

**Student Panel**

Dr. John Cordova, Moderator

Donavon Barney, Scottsdale Community College

PO Box 7612 Tempe, AZ 85281 480-628-3664

Donavon is Navajo and has attended SCC since the fall of 1998. He is a good and well-rounded student. Participating in dance and choral groups, he adds performing arts classes to the general education classes of math, science and humanities. He is a member of the Sun Earth Alliance Indian Club and runs track and cross-country. He is a member of the American Indian Honor Society at SCC, which may be the only honors society for Native Americans.

Joel Dickinson, Glendale Community College

31 W. Pasadena Avenue, #7 Phoenix AZ 85013 620-216-7914

Joel is a returning student (having worked in construction for 15+ years) who started the developmental math program with MAT 092 Beginning Algebra. He progressed to Intermediate Algebra, then College Algebra, and is currently taking Trigonometry. He is tutoring in the Math Solution (this is the second semester). Joel displays success since he progressed through the developmental courses and into college-level courses, while giving back to the department and students by tutoring in the Math Solution.

Lidia Favela, Phoenix College

5139 N. 2<sup>nd</sup> Avenue #3, Phoenix AZ 85015 602-249-4697

Lidia is from Durango, Mexico where she was an administrator in the Sociology/ Psychology field. She has been in the US and at PC for about 3 years and has followed the ESL program of study as an "A" student. Currently she is taking regular courses, such as CIS, at PC. Lidia has worked as a part-time student secretary in the Foreign Language Department and in the Office of Recruitment and Retention. She is planning to work part-time at PC for Trino Sandoval, who is the assistant to the President and who is director for the Title V Hispanic-Serving Institution Program grant.

Gedamnesh Mekonen, GateWay Community College

P.O. Box 8034 Scottsdale, AZ 85252 602-267-1422

Gedamnesh and her husband were both doctors in Ethiopia. They traveled from there to Germany, to Indiana, and then to Phoenix in 1996. Gedamnesh has been enrolled at GWC for about 3 years and is currently enrolled in the Medical Assistant program.

2. There is a need for more community outreach (community organizations, churches, etc.).
3. There is a need for more teachers who have passion and can serve students well.

**Yellow Dot Group – Dr. Sally Rings, facilitator**

1. Classes are filled with a variety of students with different abilities, goals and special needs. How to address these needs is of great importance.
2. Need to expand curriculum.
3. Need to group people who are the same level.
4. Make attending the community college more inviting through pamphlets and advertising emphasizing developmental education.

**Black Dot Group – Lois Bartholomew, facilitator**

1. Concurrence with other groups.
2. Student success is a result of passion, attitude, mentorship, strategy, support, and awareness.

**Red Dot Group – Bonnie Ehmann, facilitator**

1. There is a need to find qualified faculty and make appropriate shifts for the different learning styles.
2. Develop strong faculty development program open to all faculty.
3. Increase the level of communications between counselors, instructors, and faculty.

Dr. Art Decabooter, President of Scottsdale Community College, concluded the meeting. He stated that although development education was passé in most parts of the United States, this was certainly not the case in Arizona.

Meeting concluded at 8:30 p.m.

## Compiled Responses from Discussion Groups at the April 10<sup>th</sup> Strategic Conversation on Developmental Education

Responses were collected from discussion groups that met to answer the following two questions:

Question #1: What are the challenges that we will face in meeting the needs of developmental education students in the next 3 to 5 years?

Question #2: How should we address those challenges?

---

### Group A

#### Challenges:

- Greater variety of students, abilities, goals, ambitions, and special needs
- Backlash from taxpayers
- Develop policies that lead to change
  - Mandatory placement
  - Define “standards”
  - Funding
- Defining developmental education

#### Addressing the Challenges:

- Address student goals as well as the institution’s
  - Better placement assessment
  - Expanded curriculum
  - Use “Honors Model”
  - Promotional material
- 

### Group B

#### Challenges:

- What is the role of secondary schools?
- Recruitment of at risk students (high H.S. drop out rate)
- Placement assessment of high school students
- Quality of CC faculty; sensitivity to developmental needs
- Having a liaison between the CC and high and charter schools
- Overpopulation of students and lack of ESL instructors
- Overpopulation of H.S. classrooms
- Uninterested teachers
- Lack of respect for ESL and Developmental instructors
- Collaboration between developmental and transfer level instructors
- Not enough full-time student options or programs

- The need for prerequisites
- Changing diversity of incoming students
- Ability to partner with Student Services
- Stop “island-izing” developmental education; integrate
- Resources (\$)
- Administration needs to look at these issues top-down.

**Addressing the Challenges:**

- Departments need to communicate and work together to assist students
- Facilities (redesign)
- Let our concerns be sent to legislators
- Convocation

### Group C

**Challenges:**

- Availability of instructors to students
- Qualified faculty
  - Familiar with effective methodologies and learning styles
  - Trained in teaching methods
  - Open to learning
  - Strong faculty development may be needed
- Improve student grouping: How much diversity is appropriate?
- Developmental math instructors are mostly adjunct
- Addressing adults with learning disabilities

**Addressing the Challenges:**

- Hire full-time instructors to teach developmental courses
- When possible, require full-time faculty to teach at least one developmental course
- Continue to integrate technology
- Increase tutorial opportunities for students

### Group D

**Challenges:**

- How can instructors in non-developmental disciplines identify developmental students?
- No accountability for developmental students
- Enforce course prerequisites and placement recommendations
- Promote the developmental program as a positive experience
- Cooperative Advising

**Addressing the Challenges:**

- Self-identify / Peer Identify

- Identify on roster
  - AGECE – ENG 101 is a prerequisite
  - Have students write a letter
  - Mentor
  - “Right to Fail”
  - Convince student that the correct level is in their best interest
  - “College Success” course
  - Show the community, via advertising, developmental education success stories
  - Students need to understand that success takes time
- 

### **Group E**

#### **Challenges:**

- Passion, courage, attitude, commitment
- More diagnoses of disability
- Developmental education, not prep, but systematic approach
- Communicating with K-12 schools; awareness vs. commitment
- Open entry: full-time with development, but part-time with support

#### **Addressing the Challenges:**

- Support system / counseling department
- Multiple deliveries of developmental curriculum
- Student success includes all of the following:
  - Positive Attitude
  - Strategy
  - Support
  - Mentorship
  - Courage to Change
  - Passion